East Devon District Council - Office Accommodation

Final Site Location Options criteria Score Sheet · Scored by Executive Board 14 January 2014

			KHOWI	į.		PA	PARK		CRAMBRO	CRAMBROOK TOWN CENTRE	ENTRE		FORMER SITA DEPOT, HEATHFARK HOMION		НЕАТИРАВИ, Н	HOMITON - DEVONSHIRE ROAD (SOUTH)	OMSHMIE BO	4D (SOUTH	SKYPARK	¥
		of analys jarinises écongues derrinas	NO THEIR MEDITAGE P. HOTTED JETON REMARCE	Definition 3 DE MOLISM EXISTENCE Bush Democratic And Report D	DESIGN 3 NEW BURLS ON	MITOCVARD DIAMES	ONA SCHICE AND DISCONDINI ENGLAND	BRETAM VERY GOOD	DNA 30190 G3TA30,138 + Satz Suff Alcondoors GOOD YEBY MA33NB	MELOCATED OFFICE - BARE LAW EXCELLENT	ONA SORTO GETAZO CEN - DIGIZ DIGITAROMICON THELESCE INA SING	T3300KT CAALAMALEA	HELOCATED OFFICE -	- SOFFICE MAJORINE THE LEASE THE STATE OF TH	MELOCATED OFFICE - BREELIN VENY GOOD - ENTHE BANALANA BRITE	SELECATED OFFICE AND SOCIETAL VERY DOOD - BOUGHAN VERY DOOD - TO THE AVAILABLE BITE	- SOTAN STANDARD - THE CONTRACT AND STANDARD STANDARD AND STANDARD AND STANDARD AND STANDARD AND STANDARD AND	NELOCATED OFFICE AND SHEEKA (TICELLEST) - SHEEKA (TICELLEST) - ENTINE AVARABLE BITTE	PYRIGHES SERVES EUCHOPET - HOS CYS SERVENIA LINGUICA	SVENONÓ NAVCÉS MACACHYT, SHI CYNI SI NICOMEN ENGOCIA
1	balcases	de en ganes de	İ	i.	ii		i.		*****	į.	H	ii	i		İ	i	i	ii	i.	H
ne Comm	about her that the state of the desired to the state of the second	-	-			2	2			-	-		-					,		1
	Cord sub-life	-		-		2		-		-	-		-							-
	(equipagades orall population street population are serviced as a service or serviced as a serviced	-				2	2			-	-		*						-	-
	b Town the ere of bushing land hand by an alternative was if turnger min space?	4										-	,			-			2	9
- 1	A Tomis Des septems plays temperat generations expandements or g. Elements, guides, can all tay gards, nowahing.	-		Į.		3			,				-		-		-	100	Ī-	
1	the Plan beard between the when their bear beings of the Joh parkeas. As then said yet by the facility some dies.  Despite the head to have been the first that the second of a freedom half the facility for a said.  The first the permit planes integrangy (when the park said to be second due to make adopted (LEA)), a said of the contract of the contract of the transmission of LEA). A said of the contract of the transmission of LEA), a said of the contract of the transmission of LEA), a said of the contract of the transmission of LEA).	•		2	1088	-						-					-			٠
-	a fine of parama in Magneson and Continuents in vert, and in Univers in val. Continuency !	-		-	-			2	2	2	9	9				1		,		•
-	b Poulling Steam all regard to account	~					-	2	2	2	9	9				100 · 100				٠
11	6. Initial develops seading to publishing quadried i requirement primerium temperapose ?	-		*	-	2	2	2	2	2	2	9		No.	-					1
10000	d   Loud Amendmen for Munichery, Children and Customman.)	•						•						•	-	1830				•
-	7	2	,	1	-			-		-						68 • 20 B				•
-	Guident fine bu-desse gerands mayb, so in the state of th	-						2	2	2	9	9	8	9	2	2	2	3	2	2
+	in the case below that the description of the comments of the case of engage or the comments of the case of the ca		-											,					,	
•	a in the fundame gibb to and itemated a every. Other reposet to tack as Ord's published thereupony provides tame even	-	٠		-								*	-						•
-	the loss described described in the state of	•	**	•		•		2	2	E	8	9	-							
-	in These the complete hand of an other an the Bate between one than dealt jung of Physics	-		-			2	2		9	2	8	2	2	2	2	2	2	8	8
	the sea is backy that it TOO I have cheatment and be defined the a remain of they have game?	9	¥	-		2	2		٠				-					100	*	E
4 1	4 Chair Do the loce determin in males inspect? In the Coperal a protect has all	-		n.							•								P	2
- 1	A Street tru also facilitate from presents ?				,									0					2	2
	a fring there of feath mass with the ping the State Leads cannot in these in the \$10000 diffus between processes.	2				2	8					,	:	2						
-	d lines to and complement dates and bandering. It leaves of two complements with the calculation to the complement of th					:	2	g	2	9	2	2	2	1	2	2	2	8	¥	2
	the lumin province	-				-	1	,	-		•			•		•			•	-
	Other matters a-design	3				3	3	1	1	1		3	1	1	ă	8	5	Ħ	ž	1
	COMBRED TOTAL SCHE	Ŀ		1		2	9	3	2	2	ž	9	9	1	8	182		8	1	1
								1						The second second			S. STATES S.	100012001	Property and	TO SHARE





**Final Report** 

**In Respect of** 

The Proposed Disposal of

Site at Heathpark Way Honiton

On Behalf Of

East Devon District Council Knowle Sidmouth Devon EX10 8HL

January 2014

# **CONTENTS**

		Page No.
1.0	INTRODUCTION	2.
2.0	DIRECTIONS TO SHORTLISTED PARTIES	3.
3.0	CLARIFICATIONS SOUGHT BY DEVELOPERS PRIOR TO RECEIPT OF DEVELOPER PROPOSALS	4.
4.0	REFERENCES	4.
5.0	REVIEW OF DEVELOPER PROPOSALS	6.
6.0	ANALYSIS OF DEVELOPER PROPOSALS	8.
7.0	ASSESSMENT OF NET RECEIPTS OF SITE DISPOSAL TO EDDC	13.
8.0	REQUIREMENT OF PROPOSED PROGRAMME IN SECURING AN ALTERNATIVE SITE FOR THE RELOCATION OF THE EAST DEVON	
	BUSINESS CENTRE	14.
9.0	SUMMARY COMMENTARY	15.
10.0	RECOMMENDATIONS	19.

# **APPENDICES**

I	LETTER DATED 4 <sup>™</sup> DECEMBER 2013
II	CLARIFICATIONS
III	REFERENCES
IV	FRONTIER ESTATES SUBMISSION DATED 19 <sup>TH</sup> DECEMBER 2013
٧	TERRACE HILL DEVELOPMENTS SUBMISSION DATED 19 <sup>TH</sup> DECEMBER 2013
VI	COST PLAN FOR REPLACEMENT EAST DEVON BUSINESS CENTRE

# 1.0 Introduction

- 1.1 Thomas Lister are appointed by East Devon District Council (EDDC) to seek to select a developer for the disposal of a site of 3.65 acres and situated at Heathpark Way, Honiton.
- 1.2 This report follows on from previous reports comprising of Preliminary Review of Tender Returns dated November 2013 which reviewed the eight Expressions of Interest received from the following parties;
  - i. Mercian Developments Limited
  - ii. Frontier Estates Limited
  - iii. Terrace Hill Developments Limited
  - iv. Simons Developments Limited
  - v. Marsh & Baxter Properties
  - vi. Loc8 Developments Limited
  - vii. Consolidated Property Group
  - viii. Reef Estates Limited
- 1.3 An Update Report dated December 2013 outlined the progress of the disposal process and made recommendations as to key decisions required in the course of the disposal process following interviews undertaken with four selected parties as follows;
  - i. Mercian Developments Limited
  - ii. Frontier Estates Limited
  - iii. Terrace Hill Developments Limited
  - iv. Simons Developments Limited
- 1.4 The four parties selected for interview for the proposed scheme for the development of a food supermarket on the site were subsequently provided with additional information in respect of the levels of financial contributions which would be required by Local Authority and Highways Authority in relation to issues such as CIL contribution, highways contribution and Section 106 contribution in order to provide an update of their financial proposals.
- 1.5 Following receipt of revised appraisals from the four selected parties and based upon the outcome of the interview process, it was recommended that two parties be invited to provide final and best bids for the site.
- 1.6 A key aspect of developer selection was that the two parties were to bid on behalf of a different supermarket operator and therefore it was made clear to both parties that any proposal should be made in relation to developer and retail operator.
- 1.7 On the basis of the above, it was agreed that final and best bids should be invited from:
  - a. Frontier Estates/Wm Morrison Supermarket
  - b. Terrace Hill Developments/Asda Stores
- 1.8 Both parties were issued additional directions by way of letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013 and invited to provide final proposals by 19<sup>th</sup> December 2013.

1.9 The report below provides an assessment of the developer proposals received on 19<sup>th</sup> December 2013 at the culmination of a process over the previous 3 months and sets out our final recommendations in relation to developer and supermarket operator selection for the site.

# 2.0 Directions to Shortlisted Parties

- 2.1 EDDC and Thomas Lister have sought to provide as much certainty into the developer selection process as has been possible and accordingly have continued to provide all available information to interested parties both within the Site Information Pack originally issued and subsequently when additional information became available regarding the introduction of a CIL charging schedule as well as the level of highways contribution for the Turk's Head junction improvement as well as the level of Section 106 which will be sought for the development of a foodstore on the subject site.
- 2.2 On this basis, both Frontier Estates and Terrace Hill Developments were issued identical letters on 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013 setting out directions for the provision of Final Proposals for the subject site. The letter also confirmed the relevant dates for EDDC Cabinet and full Council meetings, when a final decision would be made in relation to developer/retailer selection.
- 2.3 The instructions to the parties also provided clarification in relation to the following requirements of the final proposals to be provided as follows;
  - i. It was confirmed that EDDC would wish to impose a contractual commitment restricting the quantum of comparison goods within the foodstore to level of 10% of net retail sales area up to a maximum of 250 sq.m.. It was noted that such requirements would be made "without prejudice" to any planning restriction and reflected the Local Authority's requirement to seek to protect comparison retail traders within Honiton town centre.
  - ii. Each party were requested to confirm whether they were interested in the acquisition of the adjoining Devon County Council Depot site and the impact this would have on their financial offer incorporating the DCC depot site.
  - iii. Each of the parties were provided with additional detail regarding the provision of vacant possession of the subject site, confirming that EDDC would be unable to provide full vacant possession of the site until 11<sup>th</sup> May 2015 at the earliest, or a date 6 months from the grant of a satisfactory planning consent free from challenge whichever is the later (i.e. a point when EDDC would have certainty as to financial receipt for the site, such that EDDC would be in a position to commit to a contract for the construction of a replacement business centre).
  - iv. Each of the parties were asked to confirm that they would be prepared to meet the cost of the EDDC monitoring surveyor following completion of the Development Agreement through to disposal and the agreement of any overage payment with such appointment providing the ability for EDDC to maintain close contact with the progress of the scheme on an ongoing basis.

- v. To provide evidence of the support of the supermarket operator to the proposal including confirmation of rents and other terms as appropriate.
- vi. It was requested that references be provided as soon as possible for two Local Authorities that the developers were working with such that verbal references could be taken out prior to the final selection of a development partner.
- vii. Each of the parties were requested to confirm that both the developer and retail operator would be prepared to enter into a Local Recruitment and Training Agreement such that the benefits of any new investment in the site would be maximised for the local economy.
- 2.4 A copy of the letter of the 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013 issued to both parties is attached at Appendix I.

# 3.0 Clarifications Sought by Developers Prior to Receipt of Developer Proposals

- 3.1 Clarification was sought by developers in relation to three separate issues within the period prior to the submission of developer proposals on the 19<sup>th</sup> December 2013 as follows;
  - i. Terrace Hill Developments sought a contact to be provided within EDDC for an urban designer which would inform the process of preparing elevations for the proposed supermarket development which may assist in the preparation of perspectives of any new building on the site. Terrace Hill were informed that EDDC did not have an urban designer available and a clarification was issued to both parties accordingly.
  - ii. Terrace Hill Developments raised questions as to whether there was any flexibility within the restriction upon the level of comparison goods and also noted that there was significant variation in the definition of comparison goods by many parties. EDDC recognise this point and confirm that there may be some flexibility in this regard subject to negotiations between the parties at the appropriate time and a clarification was issued accordingly.
  - iii. Terrace Hill Developments sought darification regarding the role of the EDDC monitoring surveyor and the scope of services which would be undertaken such that they had a greater understanding of the role and could make an assessment of an appropriate level of cost in this regard. A clarification and a brief of roles and responsibility of the EDDC monitoring surveyor were issued to both parties together with a clarification in this regard.
- 3.2 A copy of clarifications provided to both parties are attached at Appendix II.

## 4.0 References

4.1 As noted above, each party were requested to provide details of two Local Authority parties with whom a verbal reference could be taken. Frontier have provided one reference to date (a second referee has been requested) whereas Terrace Hill Developments have provided 2 separate referees.

4.2 Contact has been made with each of the parties by telephone for a discussion regarding the performance of the developer and would briefly summarise comments as follows;



4.3 A copy of the notes of the verbal references provided are attached at Appendix III.

# 5.0 Review of Developer Proposals

- 5.1 It is confirmed that both Frontier Estates and Terrace Hill Developments submitted updated proposals on the 19<sup>th</sup> December 2013 in accordance with the directions provided.
- 5.2 A copy of submissions dated 19<sup>th</sup> December 2013 from Frontier Estates is provided at Appendix IV.
- 5.3 A copy of submissions dated 19<sup>th</sup> December 2013 from Terrace Hill Developments is provided at Appendix V.
- 5.4 Key elements of the proposals are summarised as follows;

# Financial Proposal

- 5.5 It is confirmed that the parties have confirmed their financial offers as follows;
  - a. Frontier Estates
    - EDDC Site £4,800,027
    - EDDC Land plus DCC depot £5,624,555
  - b. Terrace Hill Developments
    - EDDC Site Only £5,000,000
- 5.6 All offers make allowance for CIL payments together with highways and Section 106 contributions previously identified by EDDC. In the event that planning application were submitted prior to the adoption of the CIL Charging Schedule, Terrace Hill have specifically identified that the financial offer would increase by the amount of the anticipated CIL contribution (£430,000). A similar provision would be sought from Frontier Estates if they were selected although this is not been specifically offered at this stage.
- 5.7 Both parties have agreed that an overage of 50% of additional profit above a return of 15% on cost would be payable to EDDC. This could relate to either a saving in costs or an increase in values for a scheme which would be undertaken on an "open book" basis and monitored by the EDDC monitoring surveyor.
- Whilst the offers from both parties are conditional on securing a satisfactory planning approval, site surveys etc. both parties accept that in the event that the net proceeds of disposal fall below the identified level of offer then EDDC will have the ability to withdraw from the proposed disposal at their own discretion without the requirement for payment or compensation to the developer.

## Scheme Description

5.9 Frontier Estates proposals comprise of a store of 45,000 sq.ft. and 265 car parking spaces within the first option contained within EDDC site ownership.

- 5.10 Where the DCC depot site is incorporated then the scheme will be included to incorporate a six pump petrol filling station to support a 45,000 sq.ft. store with 280 car parking spaces.
- 5.11 Terrace Hill Developments proposals comprise of a 37,000 sq.ft. foodstore, four pump self-service petrol filling station and 212 car parking spaces such proposals to be contained within the EDDC site ownership. Terrace Hill Developments are not interested in the disposal of the DCC Depot site.

# Retailer Support

- 5.12 Frontier Estates Limited have provided a letter dated 25<sup>th</sup> November 2013 of 'in principle' support for the development of a 45,000 sq.ft. foodstore in Honiton with or without the provision of a petrol filling station through Rapleys acting as agents for Wm Morrison Supermarket. However such proposals do not address details of terms and conditions which would be acceptable to the supermarket operator and therefore the rentals contained within the offer remain subject to negotiation between the developer and foodstore operator at this stage.
- 5.13 Terrace Hill Developments have provided a set of terms set out within letter of 18<sup>th</sup> December 2013 from Jon Mills at Asda Stores in which the supermarket operator have confirmed proposed lease terms subject to Board approval only and accordingly it is considered that there is significantly more certainty with regard to the deliverability of proposals by Terrace Hill Developments in this regard.

#### Programme

5.14 Both parties have submitted their proposals on the basis of the programme identified for securing vacant possession of the site which shall be 6 months from the date of achieving a satisfactory and implementable planning approval (free from challenge) subject to such date being at the earliest date of the 11<sup>th</sup> May 2015.

# Project Monitoring Surveyor

5.15 Both parties have confirmed acceptance of bearing the cost of the EDDC Monitoring Surveyor throughout the planning application and construction period and there is no difference between the parties in this regard.

## Restriction on Comparison Retailing

- 5.16 Both parties have been requested to accept that comparison retailing should provide a maximum of 10% of the net sales area as a contractual requirement.
- 5.17 Frontier Estates/Wm Morrison Supermarket are understood to have agreed to these provisions although Terrace Hill/Asda Stores have indicated that they would wish for this figure to be increased to 15% albeit on a smaller store floor area. This provision was subject to a clarification as previously set out.
- 5.18 Such a restriction would be proposed through the contract between the parties and will be additional to any restriction imposed through planning.

# 6.0 Analysis of Developer Proposals

6.1 An analysis of the different elements of the proposals submitted by the two developers is set out below;

# Financial Proposals

- 6.2 Whereas Frontier Estates have made two financial proposals (one of which incorporates the DCC Depot site) in conjunction with Wm Morrison Supermarket Terrace Hill Developments and Asda Stores have expressed interest within the EDDC site ownership only as this area of land is considered sufficient to accommodate the entirety of their requirements for Honiton.
- 6.3 The inclusion of the DCC Depot site enables Frontier Estates to increase their financial offer from to to the increased site area. Where EDDC may acquire the DCC Depot site for a lesser sum, then there may be some benefit to EDDC resulting from the inclusion of the DCC Depot site.
- 6.4 However, there are a number of potential disadvantages in the inclusion of this land. It is noted as follows;
  - a. EDDC have informally approached DCC to ascertain the availability of this land and have been unable to obtain any response at this time accordingly it is likely to be of limited interest to DCC. Accordingly there is a risk that any scheme incorporating this land may not be deliverable and in any event there may be risks of significant delays as a result of the inclusion of a third party ownership.
  - b. The inclusion of the DCC Depot site results in a larger overall retail development proposal (incorporating a 6 pump petrol filling station in addition to a 45,000 sq.ft. foodstore) and a larger foodstore is more likely to give rise to objections to the proposed use from either town centre retailers or potentially from Tesco who were refused planning consent for a 8,750 sq.m. (94,200 sq.ft.) foodstore at Ottery Moor Lane, Honiton in March 2008.
  - c. In the event that DCC were to agree to the disposal of the DCC Depot site to Frontier Estates, it is considered likely that DCC would require full access to financial proposals submitted by the developer and accordingly would deduce that their site ownership would have a value of and seek a payment for the site at this level. Accordingly, there would be no financial benefit and potential risk to EDDC in entering into any arrangements on this basis.
- 6.5 In view of the comments above, it is not considered to give further consideration to proposals by Frontier Estates for a scheme including the DCC Depot site.
- On the basis of the above, it is considered that the most relevant financial proposals are for the EDDC site in isolation where Frontier Estates have offered the sum of £4,800,027, whilst Terrace Hill Developments have proposed a land value of £5,000,000. These offers are based upon the developers requiring to make a CIL payment for the proposed scheme. However where planning application is submitted before the adoption of the CIL charging schedule (estimated to be

- Summer/Autumn 2014) then Terrace Hill Developments have confirmed that their offer for the site will increase by the level of the CIL contribution assumed to be made (£430,000). Frontier Estates have not confirmed this point to date however based upon the information provided then this is assumed to be the case.
- 6.7 Both proposals are conditional upon receiving an implementable planning consent free from challenge without onerous conditions and financial contributions in excess of those which have been previously identified by EDDC to the developers which comprise of a highways contribution of £500,000 and Section 106 contribution of £50,000 plus the requirement to take account of the CIL payment as outlined above.
- 6.8 Terrace Hill Developments have confirmed that in the event that following the undertaking of site investigations and tendering of the scheme then if the net financial payment for the site to EDDC falls below £5 million (or £5.43 million in the event that no CIL charge is payable) then EDDC will have a right to withdraw from any disposal of the site. Frontier Estates have not specifically confirmed this point however if Frontier Estates were identified as preferred developer then it will be necessary for Frontier to expressly confirm this point.

#### Developer Scheme

- 6.9 As noted above, Frontier Estates have identified the development of a foodstore of 4S,000 sq.ft. for Wm Morrison Supermarket on the EDDC site together with 265 car parking spaces. This compares to proposals by Terrace Hill Developments for a 37,000 sq.ft. foodstore, 212 car park spaces and four pump self-service petrol filling station for Asda Stores within the same site area.
- 6.10 The Frontier Estates/Wm Morrison Supermarket proposals represent an extremely intensive development of the site and whilst these appear to include the retention of existing trees along the Exeter Road frontage there are considerable doubts whether this is achievable in practice. The proposed layout provides for an extremely short distance between the site entrance from Heathpark Way and the commencement of car parking giving extremely limited queuing distances and we have considerable reservations as to whether this would be achievable in practice in highways terms. It is not considered that the proposed layout provided by Frontier Estates takes any account of the levels differentials that exist across the site which would inevitably result in a requirement for a revised car parking layout for the site as well as changes to the store loading provisions.
- 6.11 Scheme proposals by Terrace Hill Developments/Asda Stores seem to have more fully considered levels issues associated with the development of the site as well as highways issues/queuing requirements for traffic exiting the proposed scheme on to Heathpark Way. The proposals clearly indicate the requirement for retaining walls on the southern boundary of the site (Gloucester Crescent) as well as making provisions for the loading yard area being around 3 metres higher than store level such that goods lifts are required to service the proposed foodstore.
- 6.12 On the basis of the above, it is considered that the proposed layout presented by Terrace Hill Developments/Asda Stores is more deliverable in terms of site capacity, layout and treatment of site levels across the EDDC site ownership.

# Retailer Support

- 6.13 Both developers were requested to provide written confirmation as to the agreement of terms by the respective supermarket operators.
- 6.14 As noted above, Frontier Estates have provided a letter of support from Rapleys, as retained agents for Wm Morrison Supermarkets, confirming their interest in the site and confirming that should Frontier Estates be successful then they would be interested in discussing terms for a new supermarket on the site. The letter confirms that the general layouts are acceptable in principle to Wm Morrison Supermarket with or without the provision for a petrol filling station. There is no indication as to the lease terms or rentals which Wm Morrison Supermarket would be prepared to pay for the site and therefore the terms included within the financial appraisal provided by Frontier Estates (rental of £17.85 per sq.ft. for a foodstore only) must be regarded as the developer's assessment as to the likely level of rental and will inevitably be the subject of negotiation between the parties should Frontier Estates be selected as preferred developer.
- 6.15 The relative lack of commitment of Wm Morrison Supermarket is slightly surprising given their longstanding interest in the subject site as well as representation in Honiton which should have provided sufficient time for their consideration of retail trading within the town and surrounding area such that a rental proposal could be generated. The date of the letter of 25<sup>th</sup> November 2013 indicates that no specific response was made as a result of EDDC directions of 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013.
- 6.16 Terrace Hill Developments have undertaken more detailed negotiations with Asda Stores and provided evidence of a rental proposal provided by the supermarket operator which covers rental lease term (25 years), initial rent free period (3 months) and a basis for rent review (linked to increases in RPI subject to a 2%/4% cap and collar).
- 6.17 The lease proposal enables Terrace Hill Developments to provide a significantly more accurate assessment of end project value than an assessment made by Frontier Estates based upon what they consider could be negotiated with Wm Morrison Supermarket in the future.

# **Development Appraisal**

- 6.18 Both parties have provided a development appraisal to support the site offer and a review of the appraisal for both parties has been undertaken and it is confirmed that the financial contributions previously referred to as well as the requirement to fund the EDDC monitoring surveyor has been incorporated within the appraisal for both parties.
- 6.19 Both parties have included a developers profit within the appraisal and also agreed for the payment of overage to EDDC of 50% of any profit generated by the scheme in addition to a return on costs incorporated within the appraisal. Accordingly, any scheme would be undertaken on an "open book" basis.
- 6.20 Whilst the appraisal submitted for Frontier Estates is based upon a larger foodstore with a slightly higher assessment of rental, the most significant difference in the assessment of generating the residual land value for both parties is the investment

yield applied to the new foodstore. Frontier Estates have assessed a yield of 4.85% whereas Terrace Hill Developments have assessed a yield of 4.25%. The more attractive yield assessed by Terrace Hill Developments is assessed on the basis of a detailed understanding of the lease terms which Asda Stores have offered (including a highly attractive basis for rent review) whereas as such terms are uncertain for Frontier Estates – it is understandable as to why a more cautious approach has been undertaken to investment value at this stage.

## **Programme**

- 6.21 Both parties have provided a very similar programme for the delivery of the scheme which are based around securing Council Approval to enter into a Development Agreement in February 2014 and a date for the commencement of development upon securing vacant possession of the site in May 2015.
- 6.22 Key dates are identified as follows;

February 2014	Secure EDDC approval to terms of disposal
March 2014	Completion of Development Agreement between parties
March 2014	Commencement of preparation of planning application
August 2014	Submission of detailed planning application for scheme
December 2014	Determination of planning application and commencement of
	Judicial Review period
December 2014	Commencement of detailed design and contractor tender
February 2015	Completion of JR period
May 2015	Secure vacant possession and commencement of works on site
February 2016	Store opening

- 6.23 The above programme is considered ambitious but achievable subject to a relatively short period to agree terms of the Development Agreement between the parties. The programme takes no account of the timescales which may be required to any challenge which could be undertaken to the grant of any approval within the JR period.
- 6.24 The programme does however demonstrate that the possession date of May 2015 of the East Devon Business Centre does not represent an impediment upon the programme for site development.

# Restriction on Comparison Retailing

- 6.25 As previously noted, EDDC have proposed that there will be a restriction on the level of comparison retailing within any new foodstore development as a contractual provision such as to minimise the impact of any new foodstore on the subject site on town centre retail uses. This contractual term will be additional to any restriction which will be applied as a condition of planning.
- 6.26 The two foodstore schemes provide for schemes of 45,000 sq.ft. and 37,000 sq.ft. gross internal and are estimated to have net sales areas of 27,500 sq.ft. and 22,500 sq.ft. respectively based upon typical trading formats. Whilst these will not seek to offer the full range of non-food retail goods which would be offered by a larger store format between 60,000 sq.ft. and 100,000 sq.ft. retailers will seek to maximise the flexibility to offer non-food and comparison goods. It is understood that the Planning

- Inspector made reference to impact on the town centre in refusing the planning appeal for a new 94,200 sq.ft. foodstore at Ottery Moor Lane, Honiton in January 2009 and it is considered that full consideration will regard to be given to this decision in the agreement of terms with any party for the subject site.
- 6.27 It was proposed that comparison goods be restricted to 10% of net sales area subject to a maximum area of 250 sq.m. ( 2,700 sq.ft.) in our directions to the parties of 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013 although a full definition of comparison goods was not included and would require to be agreed between the parties in any event.
- 6.28 Whilst Frontier Estates/Wm Morrison Supermarket are understood to have agreed this provision as a principle Terrace Hill/Asda Stores have raised some issues and have requested that there be some flexibility in this regard such that the relevant percentage may be increased to say 15% subject to establishing an appropriate definition of the term 'comparison goods' between the parties.
- 6.29 This request was discussed with EDDC who confirmed that this principle would be considered further and a clarification issued to both parties accordingly. (see Appendix II). Any unduly onerous restriction would impact significantly upon site value.
- 6.30 It is considered that Asda Stores may typically offer a wider range of non-food and comparison goods than Wm Morrison Supermarket within their usual trading format however Asda Stores have accepted the principle of a contractual restriction on the sale of comparison goods in addition to any restrictions provided through planning. It is considered that this represents an area where detailed negotiations will be required to be undertaken between the parties in the agreement of detailed Heads of Terms between the parties and instructions of solicitors in this matter. Whilst Frontier/Wm Morrison Supermarket have agreed the restriction in terms of the proposal provided, however it is not clear to the extent that these have been considered by the retailer and it is considered that detailed negotiations would be required as to the precise restrictions whichever party were selected in relation to the site.

## Other Conditionality

- 6.31 A range of conditionality has been proposed by both parties and the key elements of this will be the securing of an acceptable and implementable planning consent for the subject scheme which is free from challenge. Both parties will also require for the supermarket operator to enter into an Agreement for Lease upon the terms identified within the financial appraisal provided. It will also be necessary for full site investigations to be undertaken as existing information is desktop only.
- 6.32 Both parties have indicated that they may seek a forward sale of the scheme dependant on market conditions at the relevant time but also have the resources available to deliver the scheme without the requirement for third party funding. Frontier would utilise funding through parent company, Palmer Capital Holdings whereas Terrace Hill would utilise retained financial resources.
- 6.33 Terrace Hill have confirmed that the offer of £5.0 million represents a fixed offer to EDDC and EDDC may also benefit from both overage as well as an increase in the event that planning application is submitted prior to the adoption of the CIL charging

schedule. Where the value of an offer is reduced – for example as a result of adverse site conditions resulting from additional site investigations undertaken (and funded by the developer) then EDDC would have the option not to proceed with the disposal.

6.34 The only circumstances where it is considered reasonable to reduce the financial offer without providing EDDC the opportunity to withdraw from the contract is where there is an increase in the level of the financial contributions previously advised by EDDC and incorporated in the financial offer as follows;

CIL

£150 per sq.m. for retail development

Highways

£500,000 contribution to Turk's Head junction

• 5 106

£50,000 payment

6.35 Frontier Estates have not confirmed that their offer is fixed as a minimum figure to date, however it is recommended that they would require to do so in order for their proposal to be taken forward.

# 7.0 Assessment of Net Receipts of Site Disposal to EDDC

- 7.1 On the basis that the offers submitted by the developers represent a minimum fixed position which would be subject to uplift provisions only as noted above then it would only be necessary for EDDC to take account of their costs in the undertaking of the disposal process as well as the potential costs arising from the disposal of the site of the existing East Devon Business Centre.
- 7.2 EDDC have agreed to pay Thomas Lister Ltd a fee of 1% of the proceeds of disposal upon completion of a successful disposal of the site.
- 7.3 EDDC received the benefit of a grant of £200,000 under the terms of an Agreement dated 6<sup>th</sup> March 1998 with the Development Commission (now Homes & Communities Agency) for the development of the East Devon Business Centre. In the event that a disposal of the Business Centre is undertaken, the Agreement provides for the repayment of this sum.
- 7.4 It is possible that the Homes & Communities Agency will be prepared to allow for the transfer of this grant and the repayment provisions to a replacement Business Centre however this remains subject to negotiation between the parties.
- 7.5 It is understood that EDDC would undertake the legal work associated with a disposal on an in-house basis and that there are no third party costs in this regard.
- 7.6 Based upon the above, the net proceeds of disposal for each of the proposals is confirmed as follows;

Developer	Offer		Repayment of Grant for EDBC	Net Proceeds of Disposal
Frontier	£4,800,027		£200,000	£4,552,027
Estates				
Terrace Hill	£5,000,000	/	£200,000	£4,750,000

- 7.7 As noted above, these represent the minimum net proceeds and be subject to increase in the event that;
  - a. CIL was not chargeable.
  - b. There was overage payable in respect of the development.
  - c. It was agreed that the HCA grant could be transferred to a replacement Business Centre.

# 8.0 Requirement of Proposed Programme in Securing an Alternative Site for the Relocation of the East Devon Business Centre

- 8.1 EDDC have identified that vacant possession of the site would be provided 6 months following the date of the grant of an acceptable and implementable planning approval which is free from challenge subject to such date being at the 11<sup>th</sup> May 2015 at the earliest (i.e. the earliest date on which such Notice could be served would be at the 11<sup>th</sup> November 2014).
- 8.2 The 6 month period would run from a time at which the developer would be committed to the payment of the site purchase price (i.e. there would be certainty to EDDC in relation to the capital receipt) and provide EDDC the opportunity to rebuild a replacement Business Centre within Honiton and complete this by the time when vacant possession is provided of the existing East Devon Business Centre located on the subject site. It is however noted that the 6 month development period would be such that a scheme would require to be able to commence on site immediately upon service of the relevant Notice and accordingly prior to service of the Notice EDDC will require to have;
  - a. Secured an alternative site for a replacement Business Centre.
  - b. To undertake the detailed design of the replacement Business Centre.
  - c. To secure all necessary planning approvals and other necessary consents.
  - d. Competitively tender the scheme and have selected a contractor able to commence works immediately upon service of the Notice.
- 8.3 It is understood that EDDC have identified a number of potential alternative sites which may be available for such a scheme and as it would be a contractual requirement to provide vacant possession of the Heathpark Way site upon completion of the disposal it is necessary for such an alternative site to be secured at the date when a contract is entered into with the selected developer. A site of around 1 acre would be required for a replacement Business Centre and asking terms for a replacement site are in the order of £295,000 although this will be subject to negotiation at the appropriate time.
- 8.4 The acquisition of such a site would require to be undertaken in advance of the contract with the preferred developer for the Heathpark Way site becoming unconditional and accordingly there is some risk that these costs could be abortive, albeit EDDC would retain the value of the freehold of the site which could be developed for this or some other purpose in the future.

- 8.5 It is possible that EDDC could negotiate an option to acquire however this will be subject to negotiation with the landowner and whether they would be prepared to entertain such a structure.
- 8.6 Additional costs associated with bringing forward the scheme for a replacement Business Centre which may be required before a disposal of the Heathpark Way site became unconditional, are assessed as follows;
  - i. Detailed design
  - ii. Securing necessary planning approvals
  - iii. Competitive tendering of the construction contract
- 8.7 These costs are understood to comprise the sum of £230,486.
- 8.8 On this basis, EDDC require to invest a total of £534,310 in the development of a replacement business centre at the point of the disposal of the Heathpark Way scheme becoming unconditional although this will include a capital asset with a value of £295,000 which could be disposed of if the scheme were not undertaken following the acquisition of the site.
- 8.9 A cost plan has been provided for the construction of a replacement East Devon Business Centre constructed to a BREEAM "excellent" standard and incorporating the costs above which identifies a total project cost of £2,374,965 including a project contingency sum.
- 8.10 A copy of cost plan for replacement East Devon Business Centre is attached at Appendix VI.

# 9.0 Summary Commentary

- 9.1 A full marketing process has been undertaken for the Heathpark Way site which has included the advertising of the site within the national property press, information sent to local agents and parties who have previously expressed an interest within the site. All parties who expressed interest were provided a copy with an Information Pack and invited to make an Expression of Interest including information outlined within the documents sent to parties.
- 9.2 A total of 8 Expressions of Interest were received and an evaluation of these undertaken and proposals scored in accordance with an identified matrix such that interviews were subsequently undertaken with 4 parties each of whom were provided with additional financial information to enable a refinement of the previous financial proposal to be undertaken. Following receipt of these updated appraisals and based upon the outcome of the interviews 2 parties were selected to provide final proposals. Each party had previously identified a supermarket operator with whom they would be submitting a proposal.
- 9.3 On the 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013, directions to provide final and best offer were issued to;
  - Frontier Estates (working with Wm Morrison Supermarket)
  - Terrace Hill Developments (working with Asda Stores)

- 9.4 The parties were invited to provide proposals by the 19<sup>th</sup> December 2013 to incorporate full details of scheme proposals, development appraisal and programme for the delivery of the project. The directions also included additional details in relation to the dates at which vacant possession of the East Devon Business Centre site would be provided and the requirements of EDDC in restricting the quantum of comparison goods sold from any new premises as a requirement of a sale contract.
- 9.5 The parties were invited to consider the potential inclusion of the DCC Depot site within any disposal. Whilst the inclusion of additional site area enabled Frontier Estates to support a higher level of financial offer for the EDDC and DCC Depot site combined the site was not of interest to Terrace Hill Developments/Asda Stores who indicated that the totality of their requirements could be accommodated within the EDDC site. It is understood that EDDC have made an informal approach to DCC in relation to this site and that no response has been received to date. It is reasonable to assume that DCC would seek a value for the site which equated to the uplift in value attributed to the inclusion of this area and therefore there is unlikely to be a financial benefit to EDDC in incorporating the DCC Depot site. The addition of this area will result in the risks associated with the acquisition of a third party land ownership and also provide the ability to accommodate a larger foodstore across the combined areas.
- 9.6 Based upon the refusal of planning application and subsequent appeal for a large new Tesco store there will be increased resistance to any foodstore development which incorporates a significant range of comparison goods which would compete with existing retail provision within Honiton town centre. On the basis of the above two criteria, it is recommended that an option be pursued for the disposal of the EDDC site in isolation.
- 9.7 The financial proposal received for the EDDC land based upon the financial contributions which were identified to the developers comprises the following;

Frontier Estates £4,800,027
 Terrace Hill Developments £5,000,000

- 9.8 The scheme submitted by Frontier Estates comprises a foodstore of 45,000 sq.ft. gross internal together with 26S car park spaces. The scheme submitted by Terrace Hill Developments on the same area comprises of a 37,000 sq.ft. gross internal foodstore, 4 pump self-service petrol filling station and 212 car park spaces.
- 9.9 A review of the layout and supporting information suggests that Frontier Estates proposals do not currently take account of the levels differences across the site which will impact upon the ability to deliver this quantum of floorspace whereas proposals by Terrace Hill Developments clearly indicate the requirement for retaining walls on the southern boundary as well as the loading bay being at a higher level than the store therefore identifying the need for goods lifts to be incorporated within the proposals. Based upon the above, it is considered that the scheme put forward by Terrace Hill Developments on behalf of Asda Stores is more deliverable from a technical perspective as well as providing a lower quantum of new retail floorspace for the town.
- 9.10 Within directions of the 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013, each of the parties were requested to provide evidence as to the support of retailers to the terms set out within the

development appraisal supporting the financial offer for the subject site. Frontier Estates provided a general letter from Rapleys as agents for Wm Morrison Supermarket dated 25<sup>th</sup> November 2013 confirming that the site was of interest to their clients and that if Frontier Estates were selected then Wm Morrison Supermarket would be interested in the negotiation of terms with the developer. This letter of support indicates that detailed negotiation of terms has not been undertaken at this stage.

- 9.11 Terrace Hill Developments have provided a letter of offer from Asda Stores which sets out rentals, lease term, rent free period and the basis of rent review. This indicates that negotiations are significantly more advanced between Terrace Hill Developments and Asda Stores than they are between Frontier Estates and Wm Morrison Supermarket.
- 9.12 A financial appraisal has been provided by both parties and it is confirmed that these both accurately reflect the requirements identified by EDDC in relation to the payment of CIL, highways contribution and 5ection 106 payments as previously identified as well as the requirement to meet the costs of the EDDC monitoring surveyor.
- 9.13 Within the initial Expression of Interest, financial information and details of track record were provided in relation to each of the developers. Both parties have the relevant experience and track record to undertake a scheme of the subject nature. As part of the final bid process, each of the parties were invited to provide references from Local Authorities with whom they had recently undertaken work in order that a verbal reference may be undertaken.
- 9.14 Frontier Estates provided a single reference at Mid Sussex District Council who confirmed that they were working with Frontier Estates towards a joint development although did provide some concerns regarding responsiveness to requests for information as well as the nature of some discussions undertaken with Members.
- 9.15 Terrace Hill Developments have provided two references for schemes undertaken in the North East of England and discussions with Council Officers at Middlesbrough and Redcar & Cleveland Council had positive dealings with Terrace Hill Developments and have worked well with the Local Authority throughout the development process. It is however noted that these schemes were undertaken by Terrace Hill's Teeside office whereas the subject scheme would be led from the company's Bristol office.
- 9.16 Directions of the 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013 indicated that EDDC would impose a restriction within contract to limit the proportion of sales area utilised for the sale of comparison goods. Both parties are prepared to accept such a restriction although discussions with Terrace Hill Developments have indicated that more detailed discussions are required in relation to the precise definition of comparison goods and their view was that a proportion of 15% of net retail areas would be more appropriate. A clarification was issued to both parties in this regard.
- 9.17 Both parties have accepted the proposed programme for the provision of vacant possession such that possession would not be available until 6 months after the securing of an acceptable and implementable planning consent which is free from challenge. The earliest date would be for vacant possession as at the 11<sup>th</sup> May 2015.

- 9.18 In considering the net receipts of disposal to EDDC, it is necessary to take account of costs as follows;
  - Repayment of HCA grant for the East Devon Business Centre
  - Costs of re-provision of the East Devon Business Centre Total



- 9.19 Based upon a minimum financial return from a sale to Terrace Hill Developments of £5,000,000 and making allowance for the above costs, then the minimum net return would be in the sum of £2,375,035 however such return may increase as a result of;
  - a. In the event that CIL is not payable.
  - b. Where an overage is receivable as set out above.
  - Where EDDC are able to negotiate that the HCA grant is transferred to a replacement Business Centre.
- 9.20 With regard to Frontier Estates, the minimum net return would be £199,973 lower representing the difference between the financial offers and therefore comprise the sum of £2,177,062.

# 10.0 Recommendations

- 10.1 On the basis of the above, it is recommended that Terrace Hill Developments should be appointed as preferred developer for the subject scheme on the basis of the following;
  - a. Higher offer for the EDDC site in the sum of £5,000,000.
  - b. A scheme which is more deliverable in terms of design and take more account of the constraints of the site.
  - c. Evidence of a higher degree of retailer (Asda) commitment to proposals.
  - d. Specific commitment provided by Terrace Hill Developments in relation to the minimum site value for the scheme.
  - e. Terrace Hill Developments and their team were considered to have performed better at interview and references provided are more positive.
- 10.2 Such recommendation is made on the basis that a full Heads of Terms is agreed between the parties and includes the requirement to reach an agreement in respect of the proposed restriction on the quantum of the proposed new scheme to be utilised for the sale of comparison goods.

Chie hance.

Date: .....13<sup>th</sup> January 2014....

Chris Thomas BSc (Hons) MRICS Thomas Lister Limited 11 The Courtyard Buntsford Gate Bromsgrove B60 3DJ

# APPENDIX I - LETTER DATED 4<sup>TH</sup> DECEMBER 2013

# **APPENDIX II - CLARIFICATIONS**

# **APPENDIX III - REFERENCES**

APPENDIX IV - FRONTIER ESTATES SUBMISSION DATED 19 <sup>TH</sup> DECEMBER 2013

Thomas Lister Limited – TL761c

Page | 23

# APPENDIX V - TERRACE HILL DEVELOPMENTS SUBMISSION DATED $19^{\text{TH}}$ DECEMBER 2013

APPENDIX VI - COST PLAN FOR REPLACEMENT EA	AST DEVON BUSINESS CENTRE

# **Equality Analysis for Office Relocation Proposal**

Proposal	Office relocation
Equality relevance	High
Scope	Customers, visitors and staff
Owner	Richard Cohen
Date	January 2014

#### 1 Introduction

- 1.1 This Equality Analysis has been developed to highlight equality considerations for Cabinet and Full Council when making a decision in relation to the council's head office. Particularly the document seeks to identify any adverse equality impacts on those with 'protected characteristics' as outlined by the Equality Act 2010.
- 1.2 Further impact assessments will be undertaken at key stages of the project and equality considerations will be fundamental in the design phase if a decision is taken to relocate. These will form the basis of consultation with our equality partners and customers.

### 2 How customers access our services

- 2.1 East Devon District Council transacts with its customers in a variety of ways including by telephone including smart phone apps; through email; through our website; face to face and through correspondence.
- 2.2 Our Benefits and Housing customers are currently able to access services personally at the following locations. These services include housing benefit and housing services including advice, homelessness issues and housing applications. Customers can also access a free phone number to make calls into the Council
  - Knowle
  - Exmouth Town Hall
  - Axminster Guild Hall
- 2.3 It is envisaged that these customer access points will remain in each of the new location options. Furthermore, following a Council decision on relocation we will explore what the type of presence will work best in other towns to respond to our communities' requirements.
- 2.4 There are also other locations that the council can use specifically for customers who are not able to visit the head quarters. Touchdown locations for mobile officers and other customer access points can be seen in <a href="#">Appendix 1</a>. It is the flexibility in our approach to our customers which allows us to serve people with particular needs in a way that suits them.

- 2.5 Our <u>Viewpoint Survey</u> (residents' survey) of 2013 provided us with the information that 79% of our customers have access to the internet. We were also able to ascertain from those that responded to the random questionnaire the percentage of people who like to deal with the council in the following ways:
  - 53% by letter
  - 48% by phone
  - 47 % by internet
  - 42% by email
  - 33% face to face.

We have recorded that on average 13000 customers visit reception annually. In comparison we receive XX telephone calls, XX intranet transactions and XX website hits. [ICT gathering stats to add]

- 2.6 Our <u>customer plan</u> outlines our aim to continue to serve our customers in ways that suit them. This plan emphasises the need to ensure that our services are delivered in ways that keep pace with changing customer behaviour and customer expectations. We have commenced our Open for Business web channel project which marks a significant investment in our website to enable our customers to access our services when they want to and from smart phones and other devices.
- 2.7 At the same time we will ensure that as new services are delivered on-line our Customer Service Centre staff follow a similar process so that customers who prefer to telephone us receive the same level of service.
- 2.8 We will make sure our officers are equipped with the necessary technology to enable them to work flexibly away from the office. A number of our services undertake regular home visits where customers are unable to access the offices. This will continue irrespective of the location of the head office.
- 2.9 Our Housing Service has a small number of cluster offices from which we deliver our housing support services for older people. These are located in the communities where we provide most of the support (Sidmouth, Exmouth, Honiton and Axminster) with mobile services to other parts of the district. This provision will continue irrespective of the relocation of our headquarters.
- 2.12 We run drop in sessions and surgeries on our estates again recognising that some customers have difficulty in getting to the main office due to cost, transport or physical disabilities. We use our network of 14 housing community centres to hold events where officers meet customers. Our community development activities are all run away from Knowle and on the estates. This provision will continue irrespective of the location of our headquarters.
- 2.13 We will keep our local presence under review as we continue to develop the ways in which customers deal with the council. It is also relevant to note that Cranbrook is a growing town and is 10.9 miles to Honiton (17 minutes) and 11.1 miles to Sidmouth (25 minutes). The Cranbrook population will of course grow materially over the next 5 years.

# 3 Identifying the risks and benefits/opportunities

Protected characteristic	Neutral	Positive	Negative
Age	✓		
Disability		✓	✓
Sex including issues relating to pregnancy and maternity	<b>√</b>		
Sexual orientation	✓		
Race	✓		
Religion or belief	1		
Transgender	✓		
Community considerations such as socio- economic factors, criminal convictions, rural living or Human Rights	<b>V</b>		
Children	✓		

# 3.1 Disability - Positive impact

- 3.1.1 The council offices are situated at the top of a steep incline making access difficult without a car. The building is poorly served from a public transport perspective.
- 3.1.2 The reception area is cluttered and cramped making it difficult for wheel chair users or people with visual impairments and the building is difficult to fit with hearing loops.
- 3.1.3 Lighting is an issue in many of the rooms and this can adversely affect people with visual impairments.
- 3.1.4 A move to be spoke offices will provide opportunities to ensure that the office is fully equipped for customers with disabilities. This will be considered during the design, build and physical move stages of the project.

# 3.2 Disability - Negative Impact

There is an access issue for Clyst House in terms of distance from main road which may negatively impact those with disabilities if not mitigated. It should be noted that the access to the building at Clyst House whilst not steep could as a distance to walk from a main road present similar challenges to those without a car as the current Knowle office. This is an issue that is flagged here and options for mitigation should be further explored if this site is chosen. The Clyst Park site is likely to be subject to mixed use development in the future so offices for EDDC could become part of a case for improved road access and bus services.

Other relocation options are closer to main public road routes and therefore offer easier access to public transport. Some are also in reach of rail stations.

# 3.3 Community considerations

3.2.1 Due to the fact that the council transacts with its customers in a variety of ways, it is not considered that this proposal will have a potential adverse impact on customers where there are community considerations.

#### 4 Staff

- 4.1 A new bespoke office which is designed in consultation with our equality partners and meets modern standards will positively impact staff with disabilities.
- 4.2 During the office relocation process, HR will work closely on a one to one basis to deal with individuals who have particular caring responsibilities and to mitigate any adverse effects of changing the head office location. This may mean an adjustment to working hours or days or implementing home/mobile working.

# 5 Outcome and identifying actions where appropriate

## What is the outcome of this Equality Analysis?

- 5.1 The Equality Analysis identifies Outcome 1: No major change required. The assessment has not identified any potential for discrimination or adverse impact for this stage of the project.
- 5.2 If there is a Full Council decision to proceed with the relocation then it is advised that we engage particularly with disability groups in the design phase of the building.

Appendix One - Touchdown spaces for officers and customers

1			_
Car parking		A small car park in front of the centre and unrestricted parking on the nearby roads	12 on site car parking spaces,
<b>Disabled</b> access		Yes	
Printing available	Yes		
PCs there	ю.		
Wi-Fi available	O Z	Yes	
If not owned by us who owns it			
Owned by us	Yes	Yes	
E-mail			sarah@a xminster guidhall, co.uk
Phone			33333 33333
Suitable to meet customers	Access is not ideal as is through flats.	Yes, would have to be booked and gets fairly busy but is far from the Town Centre.	Limited but yes, we currently have benefits surgeries here once a fortnight in the foyer. There is a laptop connection point. They are currently doing up a side room so there is a more private space.
Suitable for Officers to touchdown	Occasionally used by Mobile Support Officer at the moment.	WiFi available. Gets very booked up and is only one room,	We currently have benefits surgeries here once a fortnight in the foyer. There is a laptop connection point. They are currently doing up a side room so there is a more private space which could be available.
Site	Housing Community Room/ Centre Poplar Mount Guest Bedroom Flat 1 Chard Street Axminster Devon EX13 5QE	Housing Community Room/ Centre Millwey Rise First Avenue Axminster	Axminster Guildhall West Street Axminster EX13 SNX
Town	Axminster	Axminster	Axminster

Page 5

	Off street car parking next to building		There is a car park adjacent to the Community Centre, however available spaces are limited. Unrestricited parking on nearby roads
8	Yes- with helper assistance		Yes
	Printing has to be paid for		
	PCs available for public use		
	O Z		0 2
	Devon County Council		
	O N		Yes
Axevalley sportsce ntre@led leisure.c		achaplin @dsfire. gov.uk	
35235	01297 32693	(01392) 8 72267	
No. Located on school site.	Very limited opening times- 18 hours a week. Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare.	No.	Yes. Would have to be booked.
No. Located on school site. Office space likely to be full to capacity.	No WiFi available. Small amount of PCs available for public use.	Not suitable, project due to be completed this year which may make it suitable.	No WiFi or PCs available. Would have to be booked.
Axminster Leisure Centre Lyme Road Axminster £X13 5A2 01297 35235	Axminster Library South Street Axminster EX13 5AD	Axminster Community Fire Station Lyme Close Axminster Ex13 58B	Housing Community Room/ Centre Broadview Broadclyst Exeter EXS 3HA
Axminster	Axminster	Axminster	Broadclyst

Off street car parking next to building	Fairly large free car park a short walk away. Pay and display car park right outside. Some time limited free on street	Free car park and paying car park a short walk away	
Yes- with helper assistance		Yes	
Printing has to be paid for		Printing has to be paid for	
PCs available for public use		PCs available for public use	
ON.	No	No	
Devon County Council	Budleigh Salterton Town Council?	Devon County Council	
O N	o N	<sup>9</sup>	
	office@b udleighsa Itertonto wncounc il.gov.uk		achaplin @dsfire, gov.uk
01392 464010	01395 442245	01395 443245	(01392) 8 72267
No. Very limited opening times, 10 hours a week, as is also school library. Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare.	Not particularly, WiFi available but limited rooms available.	Limited opening times- 27 hours a week. Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare.	No.
No-opening times very limited- 10 hours a week in early evenings. No WiFi.	There is WiFi available but limited rooms. Large hall then smaller Council Chamber with two used offices coming off it.	No WiFi available. Limited space available. Small amount of PCs available for public use.	No, not open for community use.
Clyst Vale Library Clyst Vale Community College Station Road Broadclyst Exeter EX5 3AJ	Budleigh Salterton Town Council Station Road Budleigh Salterton EX9 6RJ	Budleigh Salterton Library Station Road Budleigh Salterton Exmouth	Budleigh Salterton Community Fire Station Station Road Budleigh Salterton
Broadclyst	Budleigh Salterton	Budleigh Salterton	Budleigh Salterton

		Off street car parking within 25 metres		Limited free parking available for visitors and staff.
		Yes- with helper assistance		
		Printing has to be paid for		Yes
		PCs available for public use		4
		O <sub>N</sub>		One office only.
		Devon County Council		
		ON.		Yes
	colytons portscen tre@ledl eisure.co		achaptin @dsfire. gov.uk	
	01297 552000	552877	(01392) 8 72267	
	No- based in school grounds and used almost exclusively by the school during school hours.	Very limited opening hours-12.5 hours a week. Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare.	No.	Could be negotiated. Will be a community building so will be open to access by the community. WiFi only available in Growth Point Team office at the moment.
	Based in Colyton Grammar School grounds. No extra office space.	Very limited opening hours- 12.5 hours a week. Limited space available. No WiFi. Small amount of PCs available for public use	No, not open for community use.	Growth Point Team currently occupy office upstairs with WiFi. Office space could be negotiated. The use of the rest of the building is yet to be confirmed, but ultimately, it is intended to be transferred to Town Council ownership in
EX9 GRJ	Colyton Leisure Centre Stafford Lane Colyford Colyton EX24 6GB colytonsportscentr e@ledleisure.co.uk	Colyton Library Corner of Market Place and South Street Colyton Seaton EX24 6NQ	Colyton Community Fire Station South Street Colyton EX24 6PS	Younghayes Community Centre 169 YOUNGHAYES ROAD CRANBROOK EXETER EX5 7DR
	Colyton	Colyton	Colyton	Cranbrook

Page 8

# Equality Analysis Office Relocation Version 1.1

	There is limited parking on the road leading up to the community centre		Unrestricted Parking on road that centre is on	Car Parking, no payment required
	Yes		Yes	Yes
	Yes	Yes	ON.	
	m	ر.	None at the moment, Possibly up to 5	
	ON .	<u>0</u>	Yes	ON
	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Yes. Would have to be booked and is not that busy at the moment.	Yes. Would have to be booked, is fairly busy.	Starting new project so would not be available Mon- Weds. Is in Littleham so not in Exmouth Town Centre. Could be an access point for people in Littleham.	Yes. Would have to be booked and is quite busy.
due course.	No WiFi available. PCs and printer available. Would have to be booked, is not that busy at the moment.	No WiFi available. PCs and printer available. Would have to be booked, is not that busy at the moment.	Yes. WiFi available. Potential for PCs to be installed. Not in town centre. Starting a new project so would not be available Mon-Weds.	No PCs available. No WiFi available. Would have to be booked and is quite busy.
	Housing Community Room/ Centre Ratcliffe House Burnside Exmouth EX8 3AQ	Housing Community Room/ Centre Palmer House Frazer Road Exmouth EX8 4DH	Housing Community Room/ Centre Clayton House Salterton Road Exmouth Devon EX8 2NG	Housing Community Room/ Centre Bidmead House Bidmead Close Exmouth EX8 1UD
	Exmouth	Exmouth	Exmouth	Exmouth

costs £1 an hour Max Stay 3 hrs	A small car park for 8 cars in front of the Community Centre. Unrestricted parking on roads a little walk from	Has own free car park over the road for visitors and staff.	Limited free parking available for visitors and staff.
Yes	Yes		
			Yes
			φ
o N	Yes	3	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
		222477	
No, access through flats.	Yes. Small car park out front. Would have to be booked.	There is a reception area and it is currently accessed by their own customers. There is a cafe with seating that could be used, but not for private discussions.	There are redevelopment plans for this site, so would be worth consulting with Regen. However, it is not unreasonable to expect that any new Depot could be used as touchdown or customer meeting space, and this use could be designed in
No Wifi available. Access through flats.	WiFi available. Would have to be booked.	WiFi available. No office space available but there is a cafe attached to the Pavilion.	I here are redevelopment plans for this site, so would be worth consulting with Regen. However, it is not unreasonable to expect that any new Depot could be used as touchdown, and this use could be designed in from start. WiFi currently available on site.
Housing Community Room/ Centre Albion Court Exmouth EX8 1UD	Housing Community Room/ Centre Morgan Court 15 - 17 Rolle Road Exmouth EX8 2AD	Exmouth Pavilion Esplanade Exmouth EX8 2AZ	Camperdown Terrace Depot Camperdown Terrace Exmouth EX8 1EJ

Exmouth

Exmouth

Exmouth

Exmouth

	Has own car park for Town Hall users and staff. Some time limited free on street parking available nearby.	Right next to pay and display car park.
	Yes	
	7 EDDC PCs	
	OZ	
	Yes	
	receptio n@exmo uth.gov.u 述	exmouth sportsce ntre@led leisure.c o.uk
	01395 276167	266381
from start.	Yes. Exmouth Town Council are currently paid to be the reception for the building. There are currently some interview rooms in the communal area off reception that could be used. We already meet Benefits and Housing customers there regularly.	Maybe in a future rebuild. Has a reception area and a small number of offices but these may well be full to capacity. Has seating area for swimming pool but this would not allow for private discussions. Possible future major refurbishment by LED, so our requirements could be incorporated?
	Yes. We already have offices and PCs here for Benefits and Housing Surgeries.	Has a number of offices- don't know if any available space in those. Possible future major refurbishment by LED, so our Touchdown requirements could be incorporated?
	Exmouth Town Hall St Andrews Rd Exmouth EX8 1AW 01395 276167	Exmouth Leisure Centre Royal Avenue EXMOUTH EX8 1EN
	Exmouth	Exmouth

<b>Δ</b> Ι	
12	
ge	
a	

Equality Analysis Office Relocation Version 1.1

Has own car park for users and staff.	Very limited number of spaces for users and staff. Time limited and non-time limited free on street parking available		Limited free car parking
	Yes		
	Printing has to be paid for		
	PCs available for public use		N
	Yes		Yes
	Devon Council	٧.	DSFRS
	ON	O Z	No
tennis@l edleisure .co.uk			achaplin @dsfire. gov.uk
01395 223355	01395 272677		(01392) 8
Not really. Has a reception area and a small number of offices but these may well be full to capacity. Has a seating area for cafe but this would not allow for private discussions.	Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare.	Not yet built, will not be owned by EDDC, but worth consulting with Regen as I understand that part of it is going to be available for community use?	No, no suitable entrances. Not in town centre.
There is a cafe area with WiFi available. Offices likely to be full to capacity.	WiFi available but not a lot of space available which the library may well want to reserve for library customers.	Not yet built, will not be owned by EDDC, but worth consulting with Regen as 1 understand that part of it is going to be available for community use?	Room can be hired through DSFRS (£3 per hour) and WiFi can be arranged. Limited times available for use.
Exmouth Tennis and Fitness Centre Withycombe Village Road Exmouth EX8 3AE	Exmouth Library 40 Exeter Road Exmouth EX8 1PS	New Air Training Corps Exmouth	Exmouth Community Fire Station Liverton Business Park Salterton Road Exmouth EX8 2NR
Exmouth	Exmouth	Exmouth	Exmouth

Car parking costs £1 an hour No Max Stay	Right next to large pay and display car park.	Has own free car park for visitors and staff.	Pay and display car park a short walk away. Some on street time limited free parking nearby.
Yes			
Ves	Yes	Yes	
2	m	v	
No	Yes	internet	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	ell@eas tdevon. gov.uk	edbc@ea stdevon. gov.uk	towncou ncil@hon iton.gov. uk
		41719	42957 42957
Yes, nice small room. Would have to book and it's a pay and display car park.	Open access to gallery by other officers and customers would cause some management issues. If THG were to be relocated or if building use was to change, it would give more potential space. Cafe area could be used. Has free WiFi,	There is a reception area, office and meeting spaces but building likely to be demolished as part of releasing value of development site.	Yes. We currently have benefits surgeries here once a week. However, this building is owned by EDDC but currently let to HTC. It is due to return to EDDC in
No WiFi available. PCs available. Would have to be booked.	Open access to gallery by other officers would cause some management issues. If THG were to be relocated or if building use was to change, it would give more potential space. Cafe area could be used, has free WiFi.	Could be used but building likely to be demolished as part of releasing value of development site.	This building is owned by EDDC but currently let to HTC. It is due to return to EDDC in 2014 after the New Beehive Community centre is complete. It is not likely to be available as Touchdown space as
Housing Community Room/ Centre Dunning Court Guest Bedroom Flat 1 Honiton EX14 1FQ	Thelma Hulbert Gallery Elmfield House Dowell Street Honiton EX14 1LX 01404 45006	East Devon Business Centre Heathpark Way Heathpark Honiton EX14 1SF	Honiton Town Council New Street Honiton EX14 1EY
Honiton	Honiton	Honiton	Honiton

Page 13

	ar	7. % % % % % % % % % % % % % % % % % % %		
	Has own car park for users and staff.	Pay and display car park a short walk away. Car parking available next to building for display and dis		
	## ## ## ## ## ## ## ## ## ## ## ## ##	\$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$	5	
		Yes		
		Printing has to be paid for		
		PCs avaitable for public use		NO
		Yes		Yes
		Devon Council	Honiton Town Council	DSFRS
		No O	No	NO.
	honitons portscen tre@ledl eisure.co			achaplin @dsfire. gov.uk
	01404	01404 42818		(01392) 8 72267
Beehive Community centre is complete. It is not likely to be available as Touchdown space as will either be re-let or used as a temporary home for displaced tenants of EDBC (if it is demolished).	Unlikely, nowhere appropriate. Dual use with the school.	Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare.	Not yet built, will not be owned by EDDC, but there is very likely to be good potential.	Possible for pre- arranged meetings. Maximum 10 people.
will either be re-let or used as a temporary home for displaced tenants of EDBC (if it is demolished).	Unlikely, limited office space. Dual use with the school.	WiFi available. PCs available for public use. However, there is limited space that the library may wish to reserve for library customers.	Not yet built, will not be owned by EDDC, but there is very likely to be good potential.	Yes, rooms booked and paid for through DSFRS (£3 per hour). WiFi can be made available.
	Honiton Leisure Centre School Lane Honiton EX14 IQW	Honiton Library 48 - 50 New Street Honiton EX14 1BS	New Beehive Community Centre Honiton	Honiton Community Fire Station Dowell Street Honiton EX14 INB
	Honiton	Honiton	Honiton	Honiton

Yes			o <sub>N</sub>
			Printing has to be paid for
			PCs available for public use
ON.			ON
			Devon County Council
Yes	No		Q
	enquiries @otterys tmary- tc.gov.uk	ortscentr e@ledlei sure.co.u	
	812252	01404 814317	01404 813838
Yes. Would have to book but fairly free.	There are offices upstairs in the building. Unknown if all are tenanted. No car parking.	Located on school site.	Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare. Located upstairs which is not ideal.
No WiFi at the moment or PCs. Would have to be booked, but is not very busy.	There are offices available upstairs in the building, unknown if all are tenanted. No car parking.	Located on school site.	No WiFi available. PCs available for public use. Limited space available.

8 Broad Street Ottery St Mary EX11 182

Ottery St Mary Town Council

Ottery St Mary

Council Offices

Cadhay Lane Ottery St Mary EX11 1QZ

Ottery St Mary Leisure Centre

Ottery St Mary Ottery St Mary

Ottery St Mary EX11 1DJ

Old Town Hall

Library

Ottery St Mary

Sainsburys a

short walk away, free hours then

pay and

display.

for two

No. Nearest

24hrs

car park at

**Brook Street** 

behind the institute £1

up to £3. Max stay

carpark on

Very limited

community

centre. Paying

parking outside

Community Room/

Centre

Housing

Ottery St Mary Yonder Close Ottery St Mary

16
a
pc
й

	Pay and display car park available very nearby.	Parking available in nearby streets,		
		Yes		
		Printing has to be paid for		
		PCs available for public use		o Z
		Yes		Yes
		Devon County Council	<i>د</i>	OSFRS
		o <sub>N</sub>	NO NO	ON.
achaplin @dsfire. gov.uk	seatonsv oice@bti nternet.c			achaplin @dsfire. gov.uk
(01392) 8 72267	01297 625699	01297 21832		(01392) 8 72267
No.	No reception area. We currently have a benefits surgery here once a fortnight. No disabled access to smaller rooms and cafe upstairs.	Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare.	Not yet built and will not be owned by EDDC? Not sure if there will be suitable space, but worth consulting with the Regen team?	Possible for pre- arranged meetings. Maximum 10 people.
No, not open for community use.	We currently have a benefits surgery here once a fortnight. Wifi available. There is a cafe but it's not open for general use. No disabled access to smaller rooms and cafe upstairs.	WiFi available. Limited PCs available for public use.	Not yet built and will not be owned by EDDC? Not sure if there will be suitable space, but worth consulting with the Regen team?	Yes, rooms booked and paid for through DSFRS (£3 per hour). WiFi can be made available.
Ottery St Mary Community Fire Station Canaan Way Ottery St Mary EX11 1AQ	Seaton Town Hall Fore Street Seaton EX12 2LD	Seaton Library 23 Queen Street Seaton EX12 ZNY	New Seaton Visitor Centre Seaton	Seaton Community Fire Station Harepath Road Seaton EX12 2AA
Ottery St Mary	Seaton	Seaton	Seaton	Seaton

Equality Analysis Office Relocation Version 1.1

A limited amount of unrestricted car park on road leading to centre		Car park opposite £1 an hour, max Stay 3 hrs. Longstay carpark on Manor Road 10 mins walk away, Also £1 an hour	Has own free car park for visitors and staff.
Yes		Yes	-,
Yes	Yes		Yes
2	9		m
Yes	Yes	ON.	2
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
agilbert @eastd evon.go v.uk			gwhitloc k@eastd evon.gov .uk
			01395 576798
If HSG were relocated to the new office HQ, it would create more potential space, but if this were to happen, it is possible that the office space would converted back into flats.  Access is not ideal.	Yes, really nice place. Would have to book, is rather busy already.	Yes, fine. Would have to book, not used that regularly.	Arts Centre is fairly self-contained so could be suitable, and has toilet facilities, but not suitable for a permanent set up as Arts Centre use needs to be flexible.
If HSG were relocated to the new office HQ, it would create more potential space, but if this were to happen, it is quite likely that the office space would converted back into flats . Access is not ideal.	PCs available. Has WiFi. Must be booked, and is rather busy already.	WiFi not available right now. Must be booked, is not that busy.	Arts Centre is fairly self-contained so could be suitable, and has toilet facilities, but not suitable for a permanent set up as Arts Centre use needs to be flexible.
Home Safeguard Lymebourne House, Lymebourne Park Sidmouth EX10 9HY	Housing Community Room/ Centre 90 Lymebourne Park Sidmouth EX10 9HY	Housing Community Room/ Centre Trumps Court East Street Sidmouth EX10 8BL	Manor Pavilion Theatre Manor Road Sidmouth EX10 8RP
Sidmouth	Sidmouth	Sidmouth	Sidmouth

$\infty$
$\overline{}$
ربه
ag
۵

Very limited number of spaces available. Parking could be an icene	Pay and display car park for users and staff.		Off street car park within 25 metres.	Has own free car park for users and staff.	Pay and display car park right outside
			Yes- but not to childrens area		
	}		Printing has to be paid for		
			PCs available for public use		
			Yes	Yes	
			Devon County Council	Sidmouth Town Council	
			0 2	ON.	
enquiries @sidmo uth.gov.u k	sidmouth sportsce ntre@led leisure.c	sidmouth swimmin gpool@l edleisure		stowford communi ty@btco nnect.co	
01395 512424	01395 577679	01395	01395 512192	01395 576803	
No. Limited space available.	Located on school site.	There is a seating area for swimming pool viewing, no private area.	Libraries have receptions but would not be suitable to meet customers unless they have a side office that could be booked, which would be rare.	Yes- but rooms would need to be booked and paid for.	Currently tenanted by Sidmouth TIC. Is part of Sidmouth Swimming Pool building.
Unlikely- very limited space available.	Office space likely to be full to capacity. Located on school site.	Office space likely to be full to capacity.	Has WiFi but limited space available.	WiFi available. No spare office space. Rooms would have to be booked and paid for.	Currently tenanted by Sidmouth TIC. Is part of Sidmouth Swimming Pool building.
Sidmouth Town Council Woolcombe Lane Sidmouth EX10 988	Sidmouth Leisure Centre Primley Road Sidmouth EX10 9LH	Sidmouth Swimming Pool Ham Lane Sidmouth EX10 8XR	Sidmouth Library Blackmore Drive Sidmouth EX10 8LA	Stowford Community Centre Chambers Close Sidmouth EX10 9YL	Sidmouth TIC Sidmouth Swimming Pool Ham Lane Sidmouth
Sidmouth	Sidmouth	Sidmouth	Sidmouth	Sidmouth	Sidmouth

There is parking available on the unrestricted roads around the Community Centre		
Everywhere There is apart from parking kitchen available the the unrestric roads are the Commun Centre		
O <sub>N</sub>	E 80 500 0 500	
Yes	No	Yes
DSFRS		
ON	Yes	
(01392) 8 achaplin 72267 @dsfire. gov.uk		
(01392) 8 72267		
Possible for pre- arranged meetings. Maximum 10 people.	Yes, but room would need to be booked. Doesn't get that booked up.	No
Yes, rooms booked and Possible for prepaid for through DSFRS arranged meetin (E3 per hour). WiFi can be made available.	No WiFi. Room would need to be booked and is fairly free at the moment.	All Costa Coffee shops have WiFi access.
Sidmouth Community Fire Station 24 Woolbrook Road Sidmouth EX10 9UU	Housing Community Room/ Centre Park Close Woodbury Exeter EX8 2AD	Costa Coffee
Sidmouth	Woodbury	All Towns